

Ball thrown through train in driving direction.

$tp$  = train w.r.t. platform

$bt$  = ball w.r.t. train

$bp$  = ball w.r.t. platform

Velocities etc.:

$$\begin{aligned} \beta_{tp} & & \gamma_{tp}^2 &= \frac{1}{1-\beta_{tp}^2} \\ \beta_{bt} & & \gamma_{bt}^2 &= \frac{1}{1-\beta_{bt}^2} \\ \beta_{bp} &= \frac{\beta_{tp} + \beta_{bt}}{1 + \beta_{tp}\beta_{bt}} & \gamma_{bp}^2 &= \frac{1}{1-\beta_{bp}^2} \end{aligned}$$

In general:

$$\beta^2 = \frac{\gamma^2 - 1}{\gamma^2}$$

$$\gamma^2 = \frac{1}{1-\beta^2} = \frac{1+\beta^2}{(1-\beta^2)(1+\beta^2)} = \frac{1+\beta^2}{1-\beta^4}$$

We have:

$$\beta_{bp}^2 = \frac{(\beta_{tp} + \beta_{bt})^2}{(1 + \beta_{tp}\beta_{bt})^2} = \frac{\beta_{tp}^2 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} + \beta_{bt}^2}{1 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} + \beta_{tp}^2\beta_{bt}^2}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \gamma_{bp}^2 &= \frac{1}{1 - \frac{\beta_{tp}^2 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} + \beta_{bt}^2}{1 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} + \beta_{tp}^2\beta_{bt}^2}} = \frac{1}{\frac{1 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} + \beta_{tp}^2\beta_{bt}^2}{1 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} + \beta_{tp}^2\beta_{bt}^2} + \frac{-\beta_{tp}^2 - 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} - \beta_{bt}^2}{1 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} + \beta_{tp}^2\beta_{bt}^2}} \\ &= \frac{1 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} + \beta_{tp}^2\beta_{bt}^2}{1 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} + \beta_{tp}^2\beta_{bt}^2 - \beta_{tp}^2 - 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt} - \beta_{bt}^2} = \frac{1 + \beta_{tp}^2\beta_{bt}^2 + 2\beta_{tp}\beta_{bt}}{1 + \beta_{tp}^2\beta_{bt}^2 - \beta_{tp}^2 - \beta_{bt}^2} \end{aligned}$$

Total energies:

in platform's frame:  $E_p = \gamma_{tp}M_t c^2 + \gamma_{bp}M_b c^2$

in train's frame:  $E_t = M_t c^2 + \gamma_{bt}M_b c^2$

in ball's frame:  $E_b = \gamma_{bt}M_t c^2 + M_b c^2$

**Quod demonstrandum est:**  $E_p = E_t = E_b$

Step 1:

$$\begin{aligned} E_t = E_b &\therefore M_t c^2 + \gamma_{bt}M_b c^2 = \gamma_{bt}M_t c^2 + M_b c^2 \\ \gamma_{bt}M_b c^2 - M_b c^2 &= \gamma_{bt}M_t c^2 - M_t c^2 \\ (\gamma_{bt} - 1)M_b c^2 &= (\gamma_{bt} - 1)M_t c^2 \end{aligned}$$

only possible if:  $(M_b = M_t) \vee (\gamma_{bt} = 1 \therefore \beta_{bt} = 0)$

i.e. train & ball must have equal mass or the ball must be at rest within the train...

**Ergo Conclusio: Total energy is frame-dependent!**

But (not proven here):  $E^2 - p^2 c^2 = m^2 c^4$  is frame-independent.